How is Belize Protecting Our Heritage?
CONTENTS

CONTEXT

METHODOLOGY

COMMENTARY

- OIL
- MANGROVES
- COASTAL DEVELOPMENT AND TOURISM
- ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATIONS
- FISHERIES
- WORLD HERITAGE VALUE

CREDITS
The Belize Barrier Reef is the largest barrier reef in the western hemisphere, second in size globally only to Australia’s Great Barrier Reef. The Belize Barrier Reef Reserve System (BBRRS) was the first marine World Heritage site in the Caribbean region when inscribed on the World Heritage List in 1996. It is home to almost 1,400 species of flora and fauna, a complex of reef, mangrove and seagrass ecosystems, and over 300 cayes¹. These ecosystems are treasured by the Belizean populace for their economic and socio-cultural values.

Belize is currently at a crossroads. The BBRRS was added to UNESCO’s List of World Heritage in Danger in 2009; today, the future of the site is still threatened by offshore oil drilling and damaging coastal construction. The threats remain despite the fact that more than half of Belize’s population (about 190,000 people) are supported by incomes generated through reef-related tourism and fisheries. The annual economic contribution of reef-related tourism, fisheries and scientific research is estimated to be around 15 per cent of Belize’s gross domestic product (GDP).

The Belizean government can choose sustainability and secure the long-term prosperity of the reef. Doing so would ensure that the reef could continue to support fisheries, provide coastal protection, and generate revenues for current and future generations. Furthermore, such decisive actions could help the BBRRS to be removed from the List of World Heritage in Danger.

As UNESCO’s 41st World Heritage Committee (WHC) Meeting is approaching in July 2017, UNESCO will report on the Belize government’s progress towards the corrective measures agreed in the latest Desired State of Conservation Report² (DSOCR).

The aim of this scorecard is to assess how the Belizean government is currently performing in protecting the reef and to provide some recommendations in the lead-up to the WHC in July 2017 and beyond. We will use this scorecard to track future policies and actions by the Belizean government.

¹ Protecting people through nature: Natural World Heritage Sites as driver for sustainable development. 2016 Report. WWF

WWF, Oceana-Belize, Belize Institute of Environmental Law and Policy (BELPO), Belize Tourism Industry Association (BTIA), Wildlife Conservation Society (WCS) and Belize Audubon Society (BAS) have undertaken an assessment of the performance of the Belize government in addressing the key environmental challenges Belize’s reef and its associated ecosystems face. This assessment is based on reviewing a range of publicly available information, such as published government policies, information derived through desktop research and other official publications.

The indicators that make up the scorecard assessment are focused on government policies and actions. Policies are an important indicator of a government’s commitments. However, it is important to stress that policies have little meaning if they are not effectively enforced and implemented.

Starting from a set of desired indicators for each theme, we have reviewed publicly available data relevant to the scorecard priorities, and assessed how close the Belizean government came to meeting our recommendations. The scorecard uses three scores to describe the adequacy of addressing the recommendations. In order to ensure transparency of the process, we will make available all the background indicators and calculations used to generate the final scores.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SYMBOL</th>
<th>SCORE</th>
<th>CRITERIA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>🐢</td>
<td>Good Progress</td>
<td>Significant work underway. Appropriate policies fully adopted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>🐢</td>
<td>Some Concern</td>
<td>Some progress but actions/decisions do not go far enough. Policies under development but fall short</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>🐢</td>
<td>Major Concern</td>
<td>No progress at all. No meaningful actions or policies adopted.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*In carrying out the scoring and summation, fractions with decimal point less than point 5 (0.5) were added down and those with decimal points above point 5 (0.5) were added up (e.g. 1.4 was added down to 1 and 1.6 was added up to become 2).*
REEF SCORECARD

HOW IS BELIZE PROTECTING OUR HERITAGE?

The following table includes the recommendations from WWF, Oceana Belize, BTIA, BELPO, WCS and BAS based on the UNESCO World Heritage Committee Desire State of Conservation (DSOC) Report for the Belize Barrier Reef System World Heritage Site and an analysis of relevant actions/policies being undertaken by the Belize government towards the protection of the Belize barrier reef and its associated ecosystems, where applicable an assessment score on progress.
OIL

PROTECTING THE REEF FROM OIL EXPLORATION AND OIL SPILLS

© Raúl GARCÍA / WWF
**RECOMMENDATION**

**AN EFFECTIVE FULL BAN ON OFFSHORE OIL EXPLORATION AND DRILLING IN ALL OF BELIZE’S WATERS IS DECLARED, FORMALIZED AND IMPLEMENTED.**

**Relevant Actions & Policies**

In December 2015, the Belizean government announced a ban on offshore oil exploration in areas along the BBRRS and within the seven World Heritage sites in Belize (corresponding to 15% of Belizean waters). A map of the area and required legislation is lacking.

There has been no major progress on this recommendation. The Belizean government has been working on creating the map since November 2016. The map is expected to show areas to be banned from exploration and the required legislation. The mapping of the offshore oil ban however is being undertaken internally within the government without any external consultations or inputs. No scientific justification has been made public for the 1km buffer being proposed. A full description of the technical process used to decide on the buffer is needed.

**References**

- Email sent to Oceana-Belize by Ministry of Petroleum; GOB Press Release dated 1 December 2015
- 2017 State of Conservation Report to UNESCO on the BBRRS

**Score - 1**

**RECOMMENDATION**

**A LEGALLY BINDING INSTRUMENT DETAILING THE DE FACTO MORATORIUM CURRENTLY IN PLACE IS AVAILABLE.**

**Relevant Actions & Policies**

- A moratorium on offshore exploration was announced by the Prime Minister on 15 March 2016 but has not been formalized.
- There has been no finalization of the legislation required for the announced ban.

**References**


**Score - 1**
RECOMMENDATION

THE GOVERNMENT OF BELIZE SEeks a CLEAR MANDATE FROM THE PUBLIC BEFORE ISSUING ANY OFFSHORE OIL EXPLORATION LICENCES VIA A TRANSPARENT AND FAIR NATIONAL REFERENDUM.

Relevant Actions & Policies
There has been no stated commitment to seek a public mandate. There has been no progress in engaging the public further.

Score - 1

RECOMMENDATION

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENTS (EIAS), INCLUDING OIL EXPLORATION, ARE CARRIED OUT PRIOR TO RECEIVING LICENCES; A STRINGENT ENVIRONMENTAL COMPLIANCE PLAN (ECP) THAT IS DRAWN UP WITH STAKEHOLDER INPUT IS PUT IN PLACE AND STRICTLY MONITORED AND ENFORCED. SAFETY GUIDANCE IS COMPLIED WITH BY COMPANIES PRIOR TO RECEIVING LICENCES AND ONGOING, DURING OPERATIONS, AS PART OF THE ECP.

Relevant Actions & Policies
A review of the entire environmental clearance process to address all the legislative and enforcement gaps has been undertaken by a legal consultant under the direction of the Department of Environment. Legal briefing notes from the review process were forwarded to the Attorney General’s Ministry for drafting of revised environmental regulations but this process has not yet been completed.

Draft versions of the Petroleum Policy and Offshore Exploration Guidelines & Petroleum Act were developed but the Ministry did not consult widely.

The revision process (internal within the Belizean government) of the Petroleum Regulatory Framework was initiated in September 2016 by the Ministry of Economic Development and Petroleum with a focus on both terrestrial and offshore petroleum exploration. It is expected that the revision of the Petroleum Regulatory Framework will be finalized by mid-2017 for subsequent approval by Cabinet. The process is currently incomplete.

References
- Draft Petroleum Policy and Offshore Exploration Guidelines & Petroleum Act
- 2017 State of Conservation Report to UNESCO on the BBRRS

Score - 2
**RECOMMENDATION**

ALL OIL EXPLORATION REQUESTS THAT ARE SUBMITTED TO THE BELIZEAN GOVERNMENT ARE PUBLISHED ONLINE.

Relevant Actions & Policies

No information of this nature is currently made available to the public.

**Score - 1**

**RECOMMENDATION**

EIA SCHEDULES ARE AMENDED TO INCLUDE OIL EXPLORATION IN SCHEDULE 1 (I.E. MUST HAVE AN EIA).

Relevant Actions & Policies

Public commitments have been made (for over three years) to amend the EIA regulations. EIA regulations are now in the process of being revised but no guidelines have been developed yet.

References

Terms of Reference for Consultancy advertised by Key Biodiversity Areas (KBA) project

**Score - 2**

**RECOMMENDATION**

A PETROLEUM ENVIRONMENTAL MITIGATION FUND AND INSURANCE BOND FUNDED BY LICENSEES FOR MITIGATING DAMAGES CAUSED DURING PETROLEUM OPERATIONS ARE ESTABLISHED, WITH CONTRIBUTION TO THE FUNDS BEING A CONDITION OF THE LICENCES.

Relevant Actions & Policies

The Petroleum Act makes provision for the establishment of a common fund to which the contractor(s) would contribute, to be held in trust and managed for the sole purpose of indemnification against any or all environmental damage(s) caused during petroleum operations.

References

Petroleum Act, Chapter 225, Revised Edition, Laws of Belize

**Score - 2**
RECOMMENDATION

A petroleum-specific unit is established within the Department of Environment with the required expertise and resources to monitor and respond, charged with ensuring compliance with the requirements of environmental standards and relevant laws, with dedicated funds (paid by industry) to support the unit and all information about this unit available to the public.

Relevant Actions & Policies

Such a unit is currently not in place.

References

- DOE Organogram, Ministry of Natural Resources, Environment and Sustainable Development

Score - 1

RECOMMENDATION

Belize becomes a signatory to the IMO (UN) Convention on Oil Spill Pollution, Preparedness, Response and Cooperation.

Relevant Actions & Policies

Belize is yet to sign up to the IMO Convention.

Score - 1
RECOMMENDATION

NATIONAL MANGROVE REGULATIONS ARE REVISED CONSULTATIVELY AND LEGALLY IMPLEMENTED, INCLUDING PERMITTING PROCEDURES, SPECIFIC IMPACT ASSESSMENTS, AND STRONGER FEES FOR INFRACTIONS.

Relevant Actions & Policies
Revision of the mangrove regulations was first completed in 2009 but it was never signed by the Minister; there are actions being taken currently to finalize this under the Marine Conservation and Climate Adaptation Project.

Final draft of the Forest (Mangrove Protection) Regulations (2017) has been prepared but not yet made into law. It is expected to:
- Increase fees, fines and penalties to effectively monitor and deter mangrove infractions;
- Establish higher application and permit fees to clear mangroves;
- Prohibit further clearance of mangroves on public land within MPAs;
- Reinforce the use of relevant regulations and guidelines to control mangrove alteration on private lands through the EIA process and the Integrated Coastal Zone Management Plan (e.g. allowing not more than 50% clearance on private land);
- Require a security bond as insurance in case private landowners break these conditions.

References

- Draft Forest (Mangrove Protection) Regulations (2017)

- State of Conservation Report on the BBRBS to UNESCO 2017

Score - 2
**RECOMMENDATION**

THERE ARE NO-GO AREAS FOR CLEARANCE OR LAND DEVELOPMENT.

Relevant Actions & Policies  
Some no-go areas were mentioned in draft revised mangrove regulations (i.e. for ecologically sensitive areas) but have not yet been approved and implemented.

The National Land Use Policy also needs to be implemented.

References  
- Draft Mangrove Regulations (2017)

Score - 2

**RECOMMENDATION**

80% OF EXISTING MANGROVE HABITATS WITHIN MANAGED ACCESS ZONES, AS CONFIRMED BY THE 2010 ASSESSMENT, IS RETAINED AND LEGALLY ADOPTED, MAINTAINING A RATE OF LOSS NO GREATER THAN 1% PER ANNUM.

Relevant Actions & Policies  
No target mangrove cover has been formally established. Current cover is estimated to be 90%.

References  

Score - 1

**RECOMMENDATION**

PROTECTION AGAINST EFFLUENT DISCHARGE IS ESTABLISHED.

Relevant Actions & Policies  
There is increasing macroalgal growth. Effluent regulations exist, but inadequate infrastructure and urban planning and a lack of enforcement remain a major challenge.

References  
- HRI Report Card on MAR, 2015

Score - 1
RECOMMENDATION

APPROPRIATE ZONING IS ESTABLISHED FOR DREDGING, FILLING, SEDIMENTATION AND CONSTRUCTION ACTIVITIES.

Relevant Actions & Policies

Fisheries regulations make some sensitive areas off limits but a more comprehensive zoning plan is required especially in sensitive areas that require further technical study.

The ICZM Plan has been approved. However, development guidelines in the plan are not legal requirements.

References

- Fisheries Act, Chapter 210, Revised Edition 2000. Laws of Belize

Score - 2

RECOMMENDATION

APPROPRIATE TAX INCENTIVE SCHEMES FOR PROGRAMMES OR ACTIVITIES THAT SIGNIFICANTLY RESTORE, ENHANCE OR CREATE MANGROVE HABITATS ARE IMPLEMENTED.

Relevant Actions & Policies

There are currently no tax incentive schemes developed that include supportive fiscal regulations.

References

Income And Business Tax Act, 1999
http://www.incometaxbelize.gov.bz

Score - 1
**RECOMMENDATION**

THE ICZM PLAN IS ADOPTED INTO LAW.

**Relevant Actions & Policies**
The Cabinet adopted the ICZM Plan in February 2016 was endorsed by affirmative resolution by the House of Representatives and Senate in August 2016.

The Coastal Zone Advisory Council reconvened to provide technical advice on the implementation of the ICZM Plan and its integration into all relevant laws and regulations, especially the environmental clearance process.

The ICZM Plan is currently being implemented to help support sustainable use and planned development of Belize’s coastal resources.

**References**
Coastal Zone Management Authority and Institute (CZMAI). 2013. Belize Integrated Coastal Zone Management Plan. CZMAI, Belize City

**Score - 3**

**RECOMMENDATION**

AN UPDATED LAND TENURE ANALYSIS EXISTS WITHIN THE WORLD HERITAGE SITE PROPERTY AND ALL OTHER MARINE PROTECTED AREAS (MPAS).

**Relevant Actions & Policies**
The Ministry of Natural Resources undertook a basic/generic snapshot analysis of land tenure within the World Heritage Site in 2016 but it does not provide the critical details needed to differentiate between public and private properties or identify land ownership, dates lands were purchased, etc.

**References**
- Government of Belize’s State of Conservation (SOC) report 2016 to UNESCO:
  http://whc.unesco.org/en/soc/3360

- Ministry of Natural Resources, 2016. Land tenure map graphic for Belize World Heritage Site (PDF)

**Score - 2**
RECOMMENDATION

BY THE END OF 2017, A COMPREHENSIVE NATIONAL SUSTAINABLE TOURISM BILL THAT GUIDES SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT PRACTICES FOR THE TOURISM INDUSTRY IN BELIZE IS DEVELOPED AND ENACTED.

Relevant Actions & Policies
A Sustainable Tourism Master Plan has been developed but is not being followed fully. Existing regulations and policies on tourism are out of date as they have not kept pace with current realities such as the boom in cruise tourism.

Existing regulations and policies are still out of date. The Ministry of Tourism recently carried out a series of stakeholder consultations toward the development of a new Tourism Policy.

References


Score - 1

RECOMMENDATION

THE COASTAL ZONE MANAGEMENT ACT IS REVISED TO PROVIDE THE NECESSARY LEGAL BACKING FOR THE ICZM PLAN. THERE MUST BE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION AND A NEW ROUND OF CONSULTATIONS.

Relevant Actions & Policies
There is a Coastal Zone Management Act and existing efforts are underway to revise it under the Marine Conservation and Climate Adaptation Project.

A consultancy to review the Coastal Zone Management Act is ongoing and is expected to set out the geographical (e.g. the nine planning regions), legal and policy framework within which the ICZM Plan will be implemented. The revised Act will aim to strengthen the ICZM Plan's framework, and address key gaps, challenges and opportunities for improvements to the process for integrated management of the coastal zone.

References

Score - 2
RECOMMENDATION

SUFFICIENT RESOURCES ARE ALLOCATED FOR EFFECTIVE SOCIALIZATION, IMPLEMENTATION AND MONITORING OF THE BELIZE ICZM PLAN.

Relevant Actions & Policies
The ICZM Plan has been adopted but there is insufficient allocation in government budgets currently for its effective implementation.

The main source funds to support this recommendation comes from the Marine Conservation and Climate Adaptation Project via the World Bank. Approximately $700,000 of this project’s funds is being provided for CZMAI’s operation over four years (the support is currently in its second year).

According to Belize’s Intended Nationally Determined Contribution (INDC) to the UNFCCC, the country needs at a minimum, US $500,000/yr to effectively implement the ICZM Plan.

References
- http://www4.unfccc.int/submissions/INDC/Published%20Documents/Belize/1/Belize%20INDCS.pdf

Score - 2
ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATIONS
CREATING, STRENGTHENING, HARMONIZING AND ENFORCING ENVIRONMENTAL LAWS
RECOMMENDATION

THE ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION ACT (EPA) AND REGULATIONS ARE REVIEWED AND HARMONIZED WITH OTHER ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATIONS (E.G. MPA, FISHERIES ACT, FOREST, MANGROVE, WILDLIFE PROTECTION ACT, MINING, ETC.) WITH PUBLIC/STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION.

Relevant Actions & Policies

There is an EPA in place but harmonization of regulations has not yet taken place.

The Global Environment Facility - Key Biodiversity Assessment (KBA) project carried out a review of the entire environmental clearance process to address all the legislative and enforcement gaps, which would allow for improved management of developments. Legal briefing notes from the review process were forwarded to the Attorney General’s Ministry for drafting of revised environmental regulations.

References


Score - 1
**RECOMMENDATION**

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION IS INCREASED BY STRENGTHENING STAKEHOLDER CONSULTATION MECHANISMS.

**Relevant Actions & Policies**

The current EIA regulations require a public consultation to be held but the process is not conducive to real public participation. This is because adequate information is not provided prior to consultation, and there is not enough prior notice. No feedback was provided about whether comments were shared with the National Environmental Appraisal Committee (NEAC) or taken into consideration. Meetings have been held since the 2007 amendment to the EIA regulations were passed, but no changes made.

New public participation mechanisms are being proposed in the revised EIA legislation but these have not been formalized.

**References**


**Score - 1**

---

**RECOMMENDATION**

A ZONING PLAN FOR DREDGING WITHIN THE COASTAL ZONE IS DEVELOPED AND IMPLEMENTED.

**Relevant Actions & Policies**

There is a Mines and Minerals Act (2000) and there are dredging and mining guidelines in place. However, there is no zoning contemplated in the guidelines.

**References**


**Score - 1**
RECOMMENDATION

THE TECHNICAL CAPACITY OF THE NATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL APPRAISAL COMMITTEE IS STRENGTHENED AND NEAC MEMBERSHIP AND DECISIONS ARE MADE AVAILABLE TO STAKEHOLDERS.

Relevant Actions & Policies
The current KBA project has the strengthening of NEAC as one of its objectives through the revision of the EIA regulations.

References

Score - 1

RECOMMENDATION

EIAS (INCLUDING OF EXPLORATION ACTIVITIES, TRANS-SHIPMENT) AND SAFETY GUIDANCE ARE BEING MET BY COMPANIES PRIOR TO RECEIVING LICENSES AND DURING OPERATIONS.

Relevant Actions & Policies
There is no such action in place at the moment.

References

Score - 1
FISHERIES
ENHANCING GOVERNANCE OF THE FISHERIES INDUSTRY
ENACTMENT AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE NEW FISHERIES BILL.

Relevant Actions & Policies

The Fisheries/Aquatic Resources Bill has been drafted but has not yet been submitted to either the Cabinet or the Legislature. There is a long delay as the project to draft this new bill was started in 2010. In the meantime, the Fisheries Department has rolled out a “managed-access” program nationally allowing fishers to have a direct role in managing the fisheries sector.

References

- Draft Fisheries/Aquatic Resources Bill Belize Fisheries Act Revision Project. WCS.
   http://collaborations.wcs.org/bzfisheriesactrevision/

Score - 2

RECOMMENDATION

THE USE OF DESTRUCTIVE FISHING GEAR IS REVIEWED, WITH STEPS TAKEN TO PREVENT IMPACTS FROM THESE ON FISHERIES’ RESOURCES.

Relevant Actions & Policies

No measures are currently in place to address this.

References


Score - 1
WORLD HERITAGE VALUE

EFFECTIVE MANAGEMENT AND FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY OF MARINE PROTECTED AREAS WITHIN THE SYSTEM
**RECOMMENDATION**

THE EXISTENCE OF FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY FOR WORLD HERITAGE SITE OR THE BUILDING OF A FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY MECHANISM FOR EFFECTIVE LONG-TERM MANAGEMENT OF INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL THREATS.

**Relevant Actions & Policies**

A protected areas financial sustainability strategy has been developed but is not being fully implemented. Protected Areas Conservation Trust provides funding for protected areas. Managers and co-managers are required to identify and meet funding gaps.

**References**


**Score - 2**

**RECOMMENDATION**

A WHS PROTECTION BILL IS ENACTED TO ENSURE STRICT DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES AND DEVELOPMENT INCENTIVES ARE PROVIDED FOR.

**Relevant Actions & Policies**

A WHS protection bill is recommended in the ICZM Plan. The bill is only a concept at this stage.

**References**

- Coastal Zone Management Authority and Institute (CZMAI). 2013. Belize Integrated Coastal Zone Management Plan. CZMAI, Belize City

**Score - 1**
**RECOMMENDATION**

WHS MANAGEMENT PLANS ARE IN PLACE TO ENSURE THE PRESERVATION OF OUTSTANDING NATURAL VALUE FOR ALL SITES.

Relevant Actions & Policies
Not all of the management plans for MPAs that make up WHS are up to date.

References
- HRI Eco-audit:

Score - 2

**RECOMMENDATION**

LEGISLATION IS PUT IN PLACE TO BAN ANY FURTHER SALE OR LEASE OF PUBLIC LANDS WITHIN THE BELIZE BARRIER REEF WORLD HERITAGE SITE.

Relevant Actions & Policies
There is currently no legislation in place banning the sale or lease of remaining public lands within the World Heritage as per UNESCO’s Desired State of Conservation Report. There has been no action or progress on the development of this particular legislation.

References

Score - 1